

Rough Draft  
Eds. Rose Hall  
History 120  
Dr. King

THE PURITAN DILEMMA, THE STORY OF JOHN WINTHROP  
By Edmund S. Morgan

John Winthrop was born January 12, 1588, at Edwardstown, Suffolk, England.

← into a <sup>^ aristocratic</sup> family of aristocracy. His childhood was spent happily on his father's country estate at Groton. John's father was named Adam after John's grandfather. The name of his mother is apparently unknown.

The same year John Winthrop was born the English fleet defeated the Spanish Armada and England entered the period when she became a great sea power. The defeat of the Spanish prevented a crushing Catholic defeat in Europe, and brought a temporary stalemate in the religious wars. It also solidified Protestantism in England. (Nash pg 25)

During John's growing-up years economic difficulties in England prompted many to try their luck in the New World. Land consolidation in the late 1500s dispossessed many small land owners and created an army of young unemployed persons roaming the country looking for work.

The religious wars between Catholics and Protestants which were renewed in 1618, devastated the continental market for English woolen cloth, bringing wide-spread unemployment. John Winthrop's home was in the area of England hit hardest by the depression in the woolen markets. Probably half the households in England lived on the edge of poverty, struggling for survival. (Nash p. 26) This also increased the pressure for immigration.

John's father was a good businessman. Under his management, the estate prospered and grew. He added rented lands until his rents were quite respectable.

John, as the oldest son, would inherit all this. <sup>Because of his family's wealth,</sup> At the age of seven, John studied under John Chaplyn, a vicar of a nearby church. In 1602 John went to Trinity college in Cambridge. He studied there for two years and then went back to help his father run the estate. He was married that same year to Mary Forth March 28, 1607. He was seventeen. Within the year he was a father.

1870  
1852  
18

1649  
1638  
19 yrs

link things →

(East Anglia) → ?

Somewhere along the line he had embraced Puritanism. This conversion set the stage for the rest of his life. It is not known how his father responded to his conversion.

Winthrop's first wife bore him six children and after ten years of married life she died in 1615. He was twenty-seven years old. Within the year he married Thomasine Clopton of a good Suffolk family. She died a year later. John then married Margaret Tyndal, dau of Sir John Tyndal of Much Maplestead in Essex. In her "he found a woman he could love "without losing himself in earthly passion." He received substantial dowries from all his marriages.

Sometime during these years Winthrop was accepted at Gray's Inn, where he studied law. Six years later he was back in Suffolk as one of the County Justices of Peace, a post reserved for persons of importance and property. This put him in a position where he could meet people of importance and at the age of 39 in 1637 a friend helped him to obtain a government post as an attorney in the court of wards and liveries.

There was much corruption in the court of wards and liveries and the Master of the Court made much money selling wardships to wealthy men who sometimes returned the estates to the inheritors in a state of <sup>near</sup> almost bankruptcy. The repugnance Winthrop felt for this corrupt system was later translated into laws which determined that Puritan New England would not have a court of wards and liveries.

Winthrop's experience as a Justice of the Peace and in his government post was good preparation for his primary role in the establishing of Massachusetts. During the years before the Puritans sailed for America, was a very important stage in John's personal life. During these years he felt that he had finally mastered the weaknesses in his own character. He had been a solemn youth, and his conversion to Puritanism undoubtedly increased this characteristic.

The Puritan doctrine was not an easy one to conform to. It required that a person devote himself to seeking salvation, but told him he was helpless to do anything

indicative  
of high  
death  
rate  
among  
women

but  
they  
married  
in  
1607?

→ why

→ why  
important.

Good

— What  
were  
these?

to promote that salvation. That no matter how righteous a person was, that unless he was elected by God, his righteousness would be to no avail. An individual should spend his life trying to reform the world, but evil was incurable and inevitable and would always be in evidence. Nevertheless, the righteous Christian should remain in this wicked environment, always trying to improve and even perfect it, but never succumbing to it. It seems a creed which offered little hope--the miracle of Puritanism is that in spite of the insecurity of being elected <sup>or not being "elected"</sup> and the built-in inherent possibility of hypocrisy or even self-deceit in "obtaining" a confirmation from God of his acceptance, so many Puritans lived really Holy, upstanding lives.

*Why capitalize all.*

**THIS WAS THE PURITAN DILEMMA. TO BE IN THE WORLD BUT NOT OF THE WORLD.**

Author Edmund S. Morgan is an extremely able Historian. His book reads easily and interestingly. He leads us through Winthrop's childhood, youth, and education; his involvement in the Massachusetts's Company, and election as governor of the to-be Colony. He sees Winthrop as a great colonizer--certainly one of the best that America ever had.

*omit*

*include but rewrite*

B. Kathrine Brown, in her review of his Morgan's book in the American Historical Review points out that : "The Puritan Dilemma is the clearest, most easily digested and painless presentation of Puritan dogma this reviewer has ever encountered and as such will be heartily welcomed by teachers of undergraduates in American history." This is certainly true. But the book is also a political history of the Massachusetts Colony.

*No! don't discuss book reviews!*

*Talk about Winthrop.*

In regard to this Brown points out that in her opinion there are some noteworthy exceptions from the general interpretation of the period. She claims that one of these is that: "The interpretation of the 1630 enlargement of the franchise, which many authorities say was due to the demand of the freemen, Morgan reasons out <sup>d</sup>this to be a gift from Winthrop, who was bent on carrying out the covenant idea in both

*18000/10,000*

*10000/1618*

*Avoid this verb*

*100,000 / 12% = 12000, = 10000 / 20000*

church and state." I'm not certain she has accurately interpreted Morgan on this point.

In his chapter, "A Due Form of Government," this, indeed is how it seems, but in Chapter 11, "The New England Way," the freemen insist on a reading of the Charter and a return to using it as their Constitution, and also insist on the enlarging of their freedoms as outlined in the charter. They achieve a legislature elected by themselves and later insist that the limitations and rights of the people and of their executives be written down in a Code. In spite of Winthrop's delay in acting on the people's demand for a legislature, they persisted, and chose Nathaniel Ward, a very able barrister to put these codes into writing. So it does appear that the freemen had to put pressure on Winthrop to achieve what they considered their charter rights. Even though Winthrop was indeed a wise and deeply respected governor, the people were taking no chances on having to submit <sup>at some future time</sup> to a governor who might not be so benevolent.

*Significance?*

Winthrop was, after all, an Aristocrat, and Morgan points out that while he did not actively oppose the people (as he probably felt it was God's will) <sup>that the people have these freedoms</sup> still he was not too happy about the written Code of Liberties accepted by the General Court in 1641. With these guarantees, the people returned Winthrop to the governorship, which he had held most of the time since the organization of the Company, and which he now held until his death in spite of objections of many of the ministers.

*Why?*

Morgan's biography of John Winthrop, is also a History of the Puritan experiment in America. Without Winthrop's strong leadership during the formative years of the Colony, the experiment might have disintegrated into isolated little conclaves of Puritan churches, each with their own particular views. Even when he was not governor, he led--the people came to him for advice, council and judgement.

*Wouldn't any other Governor have prevented this?*

Not to be overlooked, also, is the imprint upon the American ~~Character which the Puritans had.~~ Their strong work ethic. The idea that the labors of the mason was as important as that of the merchant. Their belief that God approved of what they were

5  
Howt  
Why?.

Q?

doing in America may have had its impress on the idea of the Manifest Destiny which appeared later in American Political philosophy.

For thirty-nine years John Winthrop gave his heart and soul to the Massachusetts Bay Colony--often at great sacrifice to his own interests. When he died in 1668/9 he was still loved and admired by the people he had served so long and

faithfully. And the political heritage founded in Massachusetts by the Puritans <sup>contained</sup> would ~~later~~ <sup>fundamentals considered later when the constitution was</sup> ~~later become a pattern for the future structure of American Government.~~ <sup>written.</sup>

Corrected copy - final before going on to B. G.

BRIGHAM YOUNG AND THE EXPANDING AMERICAN FRONTIER

by Newell B. Bringhurst

June 1, 1801, one hundred and seventy-one years after his Puritan forebears had settled the Massachusetts Bay Colony, was born another great American colonizer. His name was Brigham Young, son of John Young and Abigail Howe. His parents had moved to Whitingham Vermont, where Brigham was born, to seek their fortune. The rocky, barren soil did nothing to improve their lot in life, and after several moves with their large family, John Young and Abigail ended up in Smyrna, Chenago County, New York.

In complete contrast to John Winthrop, who was born in an aristocratic family in England and had all the advantageous that wealth and position could possibly give him to prepare him for his role as a leader, Brigham Young had very little education and spent most of his life "working out" for others to help support his father's large family.

What Brigham's early experience did teach him, however, was the value of hard work, and the desirability of getting an education, the lack of which affected him deeply.

Brigham, like John Winthrop, was a serious youth. His brother later described him as "a boy of strictly moral habits, never known to drink or use profane language. Brigham's father subscribed to an austere, ascetic Methodism. He would not even let his children listen to fiddle music--an activity which he felt would put them on the highway to Hell. The children were not allowed to dance, and such expressions as "the devil" and "I vow" were considered to be profanity. His father was very strict and felt that to spare the rod was to spoil the child.

After the family's move to Genoa, New York, his mother died of consumption June 11, 1815, and two years later when Brigham was sixteen, his father remarried, and Brigham left the crowded farm house and moved to the village of Auburn, New York,

What did they do for a living? farm

From where? -

Well how little - why - frontier environment

Were most of their neighbors Methodists or Congregationalists?

Is this typical of migration patterns of era?

Evidence

where he apprenticed himself to a woodworker to learn the trades of carpentry, painting and glazing.

As part of a program of self-improvement which was a general trend in the American Society of the day, and to get his family and friends to cease bothering him about "getting religion", he joined the Methodist church. Also common was the religious revivalism in the upper New York area where Brigham lived. In fact, the area became known as "the burned over area" because of the religious zeal which swept in waves over the area.

Good

On October 5, 1824, Brigham married Mariam Angeline Works, daughter of Asa Works, also of Puritan descent. Her parents did not approve of the marriage as they considered that Brigham was not good enough for their daughter. Brigham and Miriam moved to Mendon, N. Y., where most of Brigham's family lived. Here he went into business as a furniture maker, but was unable to realize the full potential of success he might have had because Miriam developed consumption and Brigham had to spend an increasing amount of time helping her and their two little girls. In Mendon, Brigham ~~young~~ became neighbors with a man who was to become a life-time friend and associate, Heber. C. Kimball.

Why?

In 1830 Brigham Young came in contact with a book which changed the entire course of his life-- "The Book of Mormon." A young missionary named Samuel Smith, the brother of Joseph Smith the founder of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, or the "Mormons" as they were commonly called, came into the area as a missionary for the new church. Smith gave Phinehas Young, Brigham's brother, and John P. Green a copy of the book.

Expand

Smith returned to Palmyra, New York, thinking that he had been a complete failure as a missionary. Little did he know that his first missionary call would result in the conversion of the man, who outside of the Prophet Joseph Smith himself, would perhaps ~~more~~ <sup>have the greatest</sup> impact upon the Mormon Church, ~~than any one other man~~. After two

*Append*

years of careful and prayerful study, Brigham and most of his brothers and sisters all joined the Mormon Church.

Miriam died on September 8, 1832, soon after Brigham and Miriam were baptised into the Mormon Church. Two years later he married Mary Ann Angell, who was a perfect companion for a man whose dedicated service in his new church took him away from his home and family repeatedly in the following years. She patiently bore the prolonged separation frequented by his many missions even though this must have been very trying for her.

*run on*

*Why?*

Brigham Young became President of the Church after the martyrdom of the Prophet Joseph Smith and his brother Hyrum Smith at Carthage Jail, June 27, 1844. Subsequently, he would supervise the finishing of the Nauvoo Temple and direct and carry out the exodus of the Mormon people from Nauvoo and the trek across the plains ~~and~~ to the Great Salt Lake Basin. Bringhurst discribes this migration as "the best organized exodus of any body of emigrants going West."

*Why?*

There have been many biographies written about Brigham Young, mostly by Mormon biographers, whom one must inevitably suspect of being somewhat biased in Brigham's favor. Bringhurst himself says that the most definitive biography of Brigham Young is Leonard Arrington's biography of him. Bringhurst's biography was, however a well-written, scholarly document, and it was refreshing to get a non-Mormon viewpoint of Brigham Young.

*Avoid verb*

*rewrite*

In Brigham Young, I am certain that Newell B. Bringhurst found a challenging personage to write a biography about. In addition to being the most "married" man of the 19th century, he was the spiritual and temporal leader of the most controversial religious organization ever to appear on the American horizon.

Bringhurst, like Morgan, has correctly and clearly laid out for the reader the basic tenets of the religion to which their particular ~~man~~ <sup>figure</sup> belonged. Both writers seem



to ~~have~~ accurately ~~have~~ assessed the important milestones, attitudes and problems connected with Winthrop and Young.

But you don't.

Non-Mormon writers have not always been so sympathetic to Mormonism and to Brigham Young, <sup>as Brighurst wanted</sup> perhaps that is why I enjoyed the book so much. Through 218 pages of interesting narrative, Brighurst takes Brigham Young from the time and place of birth in 1801, to his death, August 27, 1877. This was a challenging task, as there is probably no other American colonizer in American History who had such a diverse, interesting and controversial career as Brigham Young, and Brighurst was limited by the number of pages he could put in his biography.

How to be specific

Compare to Winthrop

Although there was much to concern Brighurst in writing about Brigham Young's leadership in political, economic and religious areas, he also touches upon Brigham's relationships with his large polygamous family in a sympathetic and interesting way. B. Kathryn Brown, in her Review of Morgan's book on John Winthrop calls this "the usual Pots and Pans" aspect of biographical writing. Brigham Young's "pots and Pans" were interesting to say the least, and add interest to Brighurst's biography of the Mormon leader and Prophet.

Brighurst acquainted himself not only with the theology of Mormonism but with the organizational details and changes which Young initiated as his Great Basin Kingdom grew from 12,000 in 1852 to over 100,000 by the 1870s and which say a great deal for the organizational genius of Brigham Young.

Compare to Winthrop & Morgan on Mass. Eng.

Brigham Young and his people were the only religion against which a Republican political platform was directed; the only people a United States army was sent thousands of miles to "quell"; the only state which was denied admittance to the Union even though they met all the qualifications because of a religious doctrine they espoused--plural marriage. Four American Presidents took political stands against the Latter-day Saints. Of these Millard Filmore was perhaps the most sympathetic to the Mormons. When Abraham Lincoln was asked what he was going to do about the

10  
The Civil War  
obviously  
caused  
this -

Mormons, he replied: "If Brigham Young will leave me alone, I will leave him alone,"--  
and he did.

*approach from B.Y.'s angle ↓*

The Mormons furnished 500 soldiers for the Mexican War, even when they had just been thrust from their city of Nauvoo in the middle of the winter and were at the time stranded in Winter Quarters, in dire distress. They not only furnished the troops, but the money which the Mormons received from the Federal Government, helped finance the trip across the plains, even though it delayed the trip for a year.

In spite of the great differences in their backgrounds, John Winthrop and Brigham Young had much in common.

Both were converts to their respective religions. Both devoted their entire adult lives to service for those religions.

Both led migrations across great distances, and established successful societies when they reached their destinations.

Both colonies spread out into adjacent areas. But while New England continued to expand, Brigham's colonized state of "Deseret" was considerably eroded by the Federal Government, who kept changing the geographical boundaries of Brigham's Deseret, until it encompasses the <sup>much diminished</sup> present boundary of the State of Utah.

Both leaders attempted to "isolate" their colonies from "the world" so as to keep them from the contamination of outside or "gentile" interests, as Brigham called them. Both failed in this respect. Even in the <sup>remote</sup> isolated location of the Great Salt Lake Basin, the "world" found the Mormons as it found the Puritans. But both colonies were able to keep many of the distinguishing characteristics of their particular societies.

John Winthrop would probably have been a social and political leader in his community even had he not joined the Puritans or emigrated to America. On the other hand, Brigham Young is said to have conceded to his daughter, Susa Amelia, in a conversation shortly before his death in 1877, that everything he had achieved he owed to his Latter-day Saint faith, pointing out that: "But for Mormonism, I would have

How does  
this relate  
to B.Y.?

This is what I  
want you to spend

Good

Good  
but  
still  
4 para

Speaky

Good